

Sample Judge Evaluation Form (Good Example)

JOHN MOLSON MBA INTERNATIONAL CASE COMPETITION SAMPLE JUDGE EVALUATION & COMMENT SHEET-EXAMPLE of GOOD EVALUATION FORM

Team:	Case Number:	Numerical Ranking:
-------	--------------	--------------------

EVALUATION CRITERIA	COMMENTS AND RATING Rating: E=Excellent, A=Average, N=Needs Improvement
---------------------	--

Key Issues:

- Definition of problem and key subsidiary issue

Overall industry issues well presented with the Asian region's specific problems clearly identified.

Rating: _____

Analysis:

- Qualitative and quantitative analysis
- Ability to build ideas

Industry historical data well presented. Market trend and future forecast was a good idea as it helped us appreciate direction Team intended to take.

Rating: _____

Evaluation of Feasible Alternative, Solutions and Recommendation

- Realism and practicality of solutions
- Strategic orientation and focus
- Logical tie-in to analysis
- Justification of recommendation

Buying competitor to increase market share and introducing notion of selling through local agent network were very good ideas. Team justified ability to finance acquisition well.

Rating: _____

Implementation and Plan of Action

- Consideration of cost and control issues
- Timeline and analysis of unforeseen problems

Costs associated with expansion plans likely under estimated. Timeline presented should have included consideration for competitor reaction.

Rating: _____

Handling of Questions:

- Ability to defend position, convincing, consistency with presentation
- Ability to answer questions
- Smoothness and balance of group

Well done, clearly in command of subject matter, issues and planned solution. Team members handled themselves well under pressure. Well done.

Rating: _____

Presentation Form and Style

- Presentation style/communication skills
- Creativity, professionalism
- Use of acetates and time

Well articulated, acetates were clear and concise. Team appeared professional. Overall, good content and very good presentation style.

Rating: _____

General Comments	
Strengths:	<i>Analysis, creativity, presentation skills and teamwork.</i>
Area for Improvement:	<i>A less optimistic / more realistic implementation plan is advisable. Also Should keep in mind competitive reaction.</i>
Key Reason for Decision:	<i>Team was more aggressive business wise, took more calculated risk and identified more creative growth approach.</i>

Sample Judge Evaluation Form (Bad Example)

JOHN MOLSON MBA INTERNATIONAL CASE COMPETITION JUDGE EVALUATION & COMMENT SHEET – EXAMPLE of a BAD EVALUATION FORM

Team: MBA School ABC	Case Number: 2	Numerical Ranking: 2
----------------------	----------------	----------------------

EVALUATION CRITERIA	COMMENTS AND RATING Rating: E=Excellent, A=Average, N=Needs Improvement
---------------------	--

Key Issues:

- Definition of problem and key subsidiary issue

Key issues poorly defined

Rating: ____A____

Analysis:

- Qualitative and quantitative analysis
- Ability to build ideas

Financial analysis weak

Rating: ____E____

Evaluation of Feasible Alternative, Solutions and Recommendation

- Realism and practicality of solutions
- Strategic orientation and focus
- Logical tie-in to analysis
- Justification of recommendation

Solutions presented were reasonable

Rating: ____E____

Implementation and Plan of Action

- Consideration of cost and control issues
- Timeline and analysis of unforeseen problems

Plan of Action was good

Rating: ____E____

Handling of Questions:

- Ability to defend position, convincing, consistency with presentation
- Ability to answer questions
- Smoothness and balance of group

Questions were answered adequately

Rating: ____A____

Presentation Form and Style

- Presentation style/communication skills
- Creativity, professionalism
- Use of acetates and time

Presented well

Rating: ____E____

General Comments	
Strengths:	Solid team
Area for Improvement:	Team could answer questions more concisely
Key Reason for Decision:	Other team handled questions better.